

## United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO.            | FILING DATE               | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.     | CONFIRMATION NO. |  |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|------------------|--|
| 09/674,443                 | 10/27/2000                | Sherif Safwat        | 2146                    | 8623             |  |
| 7590 08/30/2006            |                           |                      | EXAMINER                |                  |  |
| Donald E Schreiber         |                           |                      | ROWAN, KURT C           |                  |  |
| Donald E Schrei            | iber A Professional Corpo | oration              |                         |                  |  |
| Post Office Box 2926       |                           |                      | ART UNIT                | PAPER NUMBER     |  |
| Kings Beach, CA 96143-2926 |                           |                      | 3643                    |                  |  |
|                            |                           |                      | DATE MAILED: 08/30/2006 |                  |  |

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.



## UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

#### U.S. Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

| APPLICATION NO./ CONTROL NO. | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR / PATENT IN REEXAMINATION |          | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. |
|------------------------------|-------------|--|----------|---------------------|
| 09/674443                    |             |  | EXAMINER |                     |
|                              |             |  | ART UNIT | PAPER               |
|                              |             |  |          | 20060824            |

DATE MAILED:

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

#### **Commissioner for Patents**

In response to the remand from the BPAI of 8/23/05, attached is a revised Examiner's Answer from the undersigned. The only change from the Examiner's Answer of 12/20/05 is the names of the appeal conferees and their initials. No response by appellant(s) is necessary. The application is being forwarded to the BPAI for docketing and decision.

Kurt Rowan Primary Examiner Art Unit: 3643



Commissioner for Patents United States Patent and Trademark Office P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

## **MAILED**

AUG 3 0 2006

**GROUP 3600** 

# BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

Application Number: 09/674,443 Filing Date: October 27, 2000 Appellant(s): SAFWAT, SHERIF

Donald Schreiber For Appellant

**EXAMINER'S ANSWER** 

This is in response to the appeal brief filed August 9, 2004.

Art Unit: 3643

### (1) Real Party in Interest

A statement identifying the real party in interest is contained in the brief.

#### (2) Related Appeals and Interferences

A statement identifying the related appeals and interferences which will directly affect or be directly affected by or have a bearing on the decision in the pending appeal is contained in the brief.

#### (3) Status of Claims

The statement of the status of the claims contained in the brief is correct.

#### (4) Status of Amendments After Final

No amendment after final has been filed.

#### (5) Summary of Invention

The summary of invention contained in the brief is correct.

#### (6) Issues

The appellant's statement of the issues in the brief is correct.

#### (7) Grouping of Claims

Appellant's brief includes a statement that claims 1-3, 12-15, 24, 26, and 40-41 stand or fall together and provides reasons as set forth in 37 CFR 1.192(c)(7) and (c)(8).

Appellant's brief includes a statement that claims 4-11, 16, 25, 42-47 stand or fall together and provides reasons as set forth in 37 CFR 1.192(c)(7) and (c)(8).

Appellant's brief includes a statement that claims 22-24, and 37-39 stand or fall together and provides reasons as set forth in 37 CFR 1.192(c)(7) and (c)(8).

Art Unit: 3643

Appellant's brief includes a statement that claims 17-22 and 27-36 stand or fall together and provides reasons as set forth in 37 CFR 1.192(c)(7) and (c)(8).

#### (8) Claims Appealed

The copy of the appealed claims contained in the Appendix to the brief is correct.

Page 3

#### (9) Prior Art of Record

| 4715142 | RICHARD | 12/1987 |
|---------|---------|---------|
| 4970808 | MASSIE  | 11/1990 |
| 5697182 | RODGERS | 12/1997 |

#### (10) Grounds of Rejection

The following ground(s) of rejection are applicable to the appealed claims:

Claims 1-3, 12-15, 24, 26, and 40-41 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103 as being unpatentable over Richard. This rejection is set forth in a prior Office Action, mailed on July 1, 2003.

Claims 4-11, 16, 25, and 42-47 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103 as being obvious over Richard in view of Barfield. This rejection is set forth in a prior Office Action, mailed on July 1, 2003.

Claims 22-24, and 37-39 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103 as being obvious over Massie. This rejection is set forth in a prior Office Action, mailed on July 1, 2003.

Claims 17-22 and 27-36 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103 as being obvious over Rodgers. This rejection is set forth in a prior Office Action, mailed on July 1, 2003.

Application/Control Number: 09/674,443 Page 4

Art Unit: 3643

### (11) Response to Argument

Applicant argues that Richard does not disclose an electret. This is correct. However, Richard shows a biosimulating fish hook having a shank, an eye and a bend with a point terminating on the shank. Richard shows a self contained bioelectric simulating means having a anodic segment and a cathodic segment with a plastic band as shown in Fig. 2b. The definition of an electret is a solid dielectric that exhibits persistent dielectric polarization. In Richard with the anodic segment and the cathodic segment being separated by dielectric 7, a persistent dielectric polarization occurs since an electric field is set up between the anodic segment and cathodic segment with the plastic in- between.

Hence it would have been obvious to provide Richard with a known electret since merely replacing one biosimulator for another would have been obvious since the function is the same. In regard to the Massie patent which shows all of the limitations of Claim 22 with the exception of the electret. Massie is not cited to show an electret, but using an electric field to attract fish. In Rodgers, applicant argues that the electrodes do not protrude from the body and that the examiner stated that they do protrude. The specification states that they do not protrude, but clearly they are exposed to water. The sections such as probes 29, 31 connected by leads 33, 35 has an electric field between them as stated in column 2, lines 39-58 are also exposed to water and appear to protrude from the body to form an electric field to attract fish. As to the prior art suggesting the modifications, See In re McLaughlin, 170 USPQ 209 which states the test is not only what the reference suggest but rather the combination of the disclosures

Application/Control Number: 09/674,443

Art Unit: 3643

time of the invention. Also, it is not seen that the proposed modification of Richard

with the knowledge that was readily available to one of ordinary skill in the art at the

would cause Richard to be inoperative for its intended purpose which is catching fish.

The fish hook of Richard will still corrode and break after exposure to water since the

addition of an electret would not preclude the use of two dissimilar metals on other

parts of the hook shank to have the same effect of corroding rapidly in water. For the

above reasons, it is believed that the rejections should be sustained.

Respectfully submitted,

Page 5

Kunti Kowan Kurt Rowan

Primary Examiner

Art Unit 3643

KR

August 1, 2006

Conferees

Darren Ark Sque While

Peter Poen

Donald E Schreiber

Donald E Schreiber A Professional Corporation

Post Office Box 2926

Kings Beach, CA 96143-2926